

### OFFICE OF THE OMBUDSMAN

## **PUBLIC REPORT**

# ON THE FAILURE OF 156 LEADERS WHO FAILED TO FILE ANNUAL **RETURNS FOR 2005**

23 March 2007



**REPUBLIC OF VANUATU** 

6070/2007/03

Top Floor, Pilioko House PMB 9081 Port Vila, Vanuatu Email: ombud.vt@vanuatu.com.vu

## PUBLIC REPORT ON THE FAILURE OF 156 LEADERS WHO FAILED TO FILE ANNUAL RETURNS FOR 2005

#### SUMMARY

#### Outline of events (see further page 4)

This report is issued as a result of the Ombudsman's obligation under the Leadership Code Act to investigate and report on leaders who have failed to file their annual return for each year. For the year 2005, it was revealed in the Ombudsman's investigation that 156 leaders failed to file their annual returns to the Clerk of Parliament.

#### Findings (see further page 8)

- Breach of section 33 of the Leadership Code Act by 156 leaders in not filing annual return for 2005;
- Breach of section 33 of the Leadership Code Act by the Clerk of Parliament;
- Breach of section 32(3) of the Leadership Code Act by the Clerk of Parliament;
- Breach of section 13 of the Leadership Code Act by the Clerk of Parliament.

#### Recommendations (see further page 10)

The Ombudsman recommends:

- Prosecution of leaders who failed to submit annual returns for 2005;
- Amend section 32 and 33 of the Leadership Code Act to have the Ombudsman keep a register of leaders who have and failed to file annual returns instead of the responsibility falling on the shoulders of the Clerk of Parliament;
- Prosecution of the Clerk of Parliament under Part 6 of the Leadership Code Act.

### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

SUMMARY2		
1.	JURISDICTION	4
2.	PURPOSE, SCOPE OF INVESTIGATION AND METHODS USED	4
3.	RELEVANT LAWS	4
4.	OUTLINE OF EVENTS	4
5.	RESPONSES BY THOSE WITH FINDINGS AGAINST THEM	5
6.	FINDINGS	8
7.	RECOMMENDATIONS	10
8.	INDEX OF APPENDICES	11

#### 1. JURISDICTION

1.1 The Constitution, the Ombudsman Act and the Leadership Code Act allow the Ombudsman to look into the conduct of government, related bodies, and Leaders. This includes the failure of leaders to observe and comply with section 31 to 33 of the Leadership Code Act. The Ombudsman can also look into defects in laws or administrative practices, including the failure of the Clerk of Parliament in his non-observance of section 32 of the same Act.

#### 2. PURPOSE, SCOPE OF INVESTIGATION AND METHODS USED

- 2.1 The purpose of this report is to present the Ombudsman's findings as required by the Constitution, the Ombudsman Act and the Leadership Code Act.
- 2.2 The scope of this investigation is to establish and present the facts about the failure of leaders to file their annual returns for 2005 as according to the names published in the *Government Official Gazette* dated 06 November 2006.
- 2.3 This paper will also look at the failure of the clerk of Parliament in by-passing section 32 of the Leadership Code Act.
- 2.4 This Office collects information and documents by informal request, summons, letters, interviews and research.

#### 3. RELEVANT LAWS

Relevant parts of the following laws are reproduced in Appendix A.

Constitution of the Republic of Vanuatu Leadership Code Act 1998 Leadership Code (Amendment) Act 1999

#### 4. OUTLINE OF EVENTS

- 4.1 Article 67 of the Constitution of the Republic of Vanuatu defines those who are considered to be leaders. In addition to this, section 5 of the Leadership Code Act 1998 further declares those who are leaders under the Leadership Code. (See Appendix A)
- 4.2 Section 31 of the *Leadership Code Act* requires that all leaders complete an annual return for the preceding year setting out details of the leaders' assets and liabilities in accordance with the form in the Schedule (**Appendix B**) and submit it to the Clerk of Parliament by 01 March in each year.
- 4.3 Section 32 of the same Act requires the Clerk of Parliament to publish in the *Gazette* on or before 14 March in each year a list of the leaders who have given or failed to give the Clerk an annual Return.
- 4.4 Section 33 also requires the Clerk to warn the leaders who fail to file an annual return by 01 March in each year. A leader who fails to submit an

- annual return after being warned is guilty of breaching the *Leadership Code* Act.
- 4.5 On 06 November 2006, the *Government Official Gazette No.30* was published which contained the list of leaders who had submitted an annual return and also those who failed to file an annual return for 2005 to the Clerk of Parliament.
- 4.6 162 leaders were listed as those who failed to submit their 2005 Annual Returns. (Refer to **Appendix C**)
- 4.7 On the dates 16 November 2006 and 08 December 2006 respectively, the Ombudsman contacted the Clerk of Parliament in accordance with his duty under section 32 and 33 of the *Leadership Code Act*.
- 4.8 On 14 December 2006, a response was received from the Clerk indicating that he did not observe the respective sections 32 and 33 as he has other duties to take care of. (see **Appendix D**)

### 5. RESPONSES BY THOSE WITH FINDINGS AGAINST THEM

5.1 The Ombudsman notified all people or bodies complained of and gave them the right to reply by way of issuing a working paper which was provided prior to preparation of this public report to give the individuals mentioned an opportunity to respond.

Because the Ombudsman was also mentioned in the *Gazette* as one who failed to file his annual returns for 2005, advice was sought from the Attorney General of the Republic of Vanuatu. In accordance with section 34(6) of the *Leadership Code Act*, the Attorney General assumed the powers of the Ombudsman in sending a working paper to the Ombudsman, Peter K. Taurakoto. It is unnecessary that a separate public report be issued by the Attorney General to disclose his findings. His findings are included in this report, as stated below.

- 5.2 Responses were received from the following:
  - Hon. Sato Kilman who is the current Minister for Foreign Affairs stated in a letter to the Ombudsman that he has submitted his 2005 Annual Return to the Speaker of Parliament at the time it was due. Upon enquiries the Speaker confirmed this, however, he, (the Speaker) did not forward it in time to the Clerk of Parliament. He has no intention of ignoring his obligation under the Leadership Code Act.
  - Nadia Kanegai called the Ombudsman on 22 January 2007 stating that since 2004, she has resigned her position as member of the Public Service Commission and as such was not obliged to file an annual return for 2005.
  - Hon. Joshua Kalsakau came to the Ombudsman's Office to state that the reason why he did not submit his annual returns was because he did not know about the form.
  - On 22 January 2007, Morris Kaloran who was then the Director of Women's Affairs visited the Ombudsman's Office to state that he remembered submitting his annual return form for 2005 last year as he

was discussing this together with the Acting Director of the Prime Minister's Office, Mrs Louisette Issachar. He did not know how the Clerk of Parliament included his name as one who did not submit his annual return for 2005.

- On 23 January, the Ombudsman received a response from Hon. Willie Jimmy Tapanga Rarua that he has no further comments or documents to assist the Ombudsman's investigation on this matter.
- On 23 Janury 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Mr Daniel K. Yawha who was a former member of the National Sports Council, writing also on behalf of Mr Allan Lieu, Mr Cyril Mainguy and Mr Daniel Lamoureux. He stated that he and the other members of the Council had their appointment terminated by the Minister of Youth and Sports some 6 months after the appointment and since their appointment was not within a year period, they cannot file their annual returns for 2005. The Ombudsman, nevertheless, has responded to their letter and pointed out section 31(2)(a) of the Leadership Code Act, in which annual returns must be given to the Clerk of Parliament within 2 months of becoming a leader.
- On 24 January 2007, the Attorney General received a response from the Ombudsman, Peter K. Taurakoto that the Clerk made an error in including his name as one who failed to file his annual return for 2005. He stated that he was appointed to the position of the Ombudsman on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2005 and on 4 May 2005, he submitted his Annual Return Declaration Form to the Clerk of Parliament. He also submitted documents to prove that the annual return form was received by Leitong at Parliament on 6<sup>th</sup> May 2005.
- On 25 January 2005, Mr James Narwayeng, the Acting Principal Immigration Officer visited the Ombudsman's Office to state that he had filled the Annual Return Form for 2005 and handed it to the Secretary to deliver it to the Clerk of Parliament. However, upon following up with the Immigration Department "Outward Mail Register", the Ombudsman found that there was no record of any such submission.
- On 25 January 2007, Mr Joseph Kasten, Director of Civil Aviation visited the Office to state that he remembered submitting his annual return form for 2005. However, he submitted it late in November 2006.
- On 25 January 2007, the Ombudsman received a letter from Mr Geordie Mackenzie-Reur stating that he was not given a reminder for annual return 2005 and that he made a submission but it was late.
- On 2 February 2007, Mr David Lambukly visited the Ombudsman's Office to state that he did not file his annual return for 2005 as he was only vaguely aware of his obligations under the Leadership Code Act.
- On 2 February 2007, a response was received by Dr Jean Luc Bador stating that the Clerk of Parliament did not send out a notice and a form in February of 2006 so it slipped his mind in submitting an annual return for 2005.

- On 5 February 2007, Mr Ericson Sammy visited the Ombudsman's Office to state that while he was Acting Director for Geology and Mines, he remembered having filled out the annual return form in early 2006. He gave the form to the Corporate Services Manager at the Ministry of Lands. He did not know what happened after that.
- On 5 February 2007, a response was received from Mr Morrie Tabi, a Councillor of PENAMA Province Council. He stated that to the best of his knowledge, he has not yet failed to file his annual return ever since taking up the office of the Councillor. He enclosed an annual return dated 29/01/07.
- On 6 February 2007, Mr Clarence Marae visited the Ombudsman's Office stating that he did not receive any warning from the Clerk and that was why he failed to submit his annual return for 2005.
- On 6 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Mr Hillary Toa, the Public Solicitor stating that his appointment was sometimes on 18 July 2005, where he came in late into this arena of compliance and also were not aware of any notice being given of such a pressing requirement or of any datelines whereby such annual returns were to be given.
- On 6 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Tony Ata, a member of the Education Selection Board. He stated that he was not aware of this responsibility when he was appointed.
- On 7 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response by phone from Councillor Michel Houlen of MALAMPA Province. He said that he has filled the Annual Return Form and left it at the Provincial Area Council Office at Liro, Paama for them to post to the Clerk of Parliament. He is unsure what happened to it after that.
- On 7 February 2007, the Ombudsman received by phone a response from Joe lautim, who was former Acting Director of Education. He went on study leave in September 2005 and his membership ceased as member of the Vanuatu National Training Council.
- On 8 February 2007, Mr John Licht, called the Office of the Ombudsman and further sent an email to confirm that he has never received any advice during his tenure in office with the Vanuatu Post Limited as Manager Operations plus the fact that he was only a Manager and not the overall executive head of the company.

,

- On 8 February 2007, a response was received from Mr Philip Malas former member of Vanuatu National Tourism Office (VNTO) who stated that he has ceased to become a Board member of the VNTO on March 2005. The new Vanuatu Tour Operators Association President was voted in to replace him.
- 14 February 2007, Hon. Malon Hopsmander called the Ombudsman's Office to state that he did not think that he failed to file his annual return as he was sure that he gave it to the Clerk of Parliament.
- On 16 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Mr Garry Blake confirming that he has forwarded to the clerk of Parliament on 20 October 2006 together with the annual return for 2006.
- On 19 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Mr Jerry Ishmael. He attached copies of his annual returns for 2005 which was sent to the Clerk of Parliament on 28 February 2005.
- On 19 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Councillor Tom Reuben of SHEFA Provincial government that he did not send in his annual return for 2005 and his reason was that he did not receive any form from the Office of the Ombudsman. The Ombudsman has responded to Mr Reuben stating that he himself is obliged to pick up the form from the Office of the Clerk of Parliament.
- On 27 February 2007, Mr Sokomanu Motoutorua visited the Ombudsman's Office to clarify that he did submit his annual returns for 2005. He did not understand why his name was included in the working paper as one who failed to submit his returns.
- On 27 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Councillor lata Watson Kowiameta stating that he did not submit his annual return for 2006 (2005?) because he received the forms late.
- On 27 February 2007, the Ombudsman received a response from Hon. Dunstan Hilton, Minister of Youth Development stating that he did not remember receiving any advice from any authority to submit the information requested, i.e annual returns.

#### 6. **FINDINGS**

- BREACH OF SECTION 33 OF LEADRSHIP CODE ACT BY 6.1 Finding 1: 156 LEADERS IN NOT FILING ANNUAL RETURN FOR 2005
- 6.1.1 Except as indicated below in paragraph 6.1.2, as according to the Official Gazette No. 30 dated 06 November 2006, and the responses received to the working paper, 156 leaders were found by the Ombudsman as having failed to file their annual returns for 2005 (refer to Appendix C). As such, these leaders mentioned in the above Appendix have breached section 33 of the Leadership Code Act 1998.

ì

7

3 ľ

- 6.1.2 These leaders were found by the Ombudsman as having justified reasons for failing to file or filed their annual returns for 2005. They are; Mrs Nadia Kanegai, Mr Peter K. Taurakoto, Mr Philip Malas, Mr Joe lautim, Mr John Licht and Mr Jerry Ishmael.
- 6.1.3 The Ombudsman also found that Hon. Sato Kilman, Morris Kaloran, Councillor Sokomanu Motoutorua, Mr Ericson Sammy, Councillor Morrie Tabi, Councillor Michel Houlen, and Hon. Malon Hopsmander have indicated that they have filed their annual returns for 2005, but were unsure whether or not it has reached the Office of the Clerk of Parliament.
- 6.1.4 The Ombudsman also found that Mr Joseph Kasten and Mr Garry Blake, although have filed their annual return for 2005, have submitted them late outside the legal deadline of 1<sup>st</sup> March 2006.

# 6.2 Finding 2: BREACH OF SECTION 33 OF THE LEADERSHIP CODE ACT BY THE CLERK OF PARLIAMENT

- 6.2.1 As provided by section 33(a), the Clerk of Parliament is required to warn leaders in writing who failed to submit their annual return by 1 March. According to his letter to the Ombudsman (Appendix D), he pointed out that he did not provide warning to any of the leaders who failed to submit annual returns by the required date prior to publication in the Official Gazette. As such he could not provide to the Ombudsman a list of leaders whom he has written warning to.
- 6.2.2 As section 33(a) of the *Leadership Code Act* imposes such a duty on the Clerk of Parliament and he fails to observe that duty, he is also in breach of section 33 of the *Leadership Code Act*.
- 6.3 Finding 3: BREACH OF SECTION 32(3) OF THE LEADERSHIP CODE ACT BY THE CLERK OF PARLIAMENT
- 6.3.1 Under section 32(3), the Clerk of Parliament must publish in the *Gazette* on or before 14 March in each year a list of the leaders who have given or failed to give the Clerk an annual return. It is obvious that the Clerk only published these names in the *Gazette* dated 6 November 2006, nearly eight (8) months after the date stated by s.32(3) above.
- 6.4 Finding 4: BREACH OF SECTION 13 OF THE LEADERSHIP CODE ACT BY THE CLERK OF PARLIAMENT
- 6.4.1 As a leader also under section 5(p) of the *Leadership Code Act*, the Clerk of Parliament is expected to observe and comply with the laws that affect his area of duty. It appeared from his conduct and response that he has failed to observe and comply with this law and as a result breached section 19 of the Code.

#### 7. RECOMMENDATIONS

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

The Ombudsman makes the following recommendations in regards to the above findings:

#### 7.1 Recommendation 1:

In accordance with section 34(2) and 35 of the *Leadership Code Act*, the Public Prosecutor considers this report and commence proceedings of prosecuting the leaders whom the Ombudsman found to have breached the *Leadership Code Act* in not filing their annual returns for 2005.

#### 7.2 Recommendation 2:

The Government through the Parliament, amend the *Leadership Code Act*, especially sections 32 and 33 to have the Ombudsman the sole person or authority to scrutinize and keep a register of leaders who have and also failed to file annual returns.

#### 7.3 Recommendation 3:

The Clerk of Parliament seriously considers his duties under the Leadership Code Act in the coming years until such time the Leadership Code Act is amended to cater for the above changes.

#### 7.4 Recommendation 4:

The Clerk of Parliament be prosecuted under Part 6 of the *Leadership Code Act* for breaching the Code.

Peter K. TAURAKOTO
OMBUDSMAN OF THE REPUBLIC OF VANDATI

- 8. INDEX OF APPENDICES
- A Relevant Laws
- B Copy of Annual Return Form
- C Copy of List of Leaders who failed to submit Annual Returns for 2005
- D Copy of Letter from Clerk of Parliament (undated)

#### Appendix A

#### CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF VANUATU

#### **CONDUCT OF LEADERS**

- Any person defined as a leader in Article 67 has a duty to conduct himself in such a way, both in his public and private life, so as not to—
  - place himself in a position in which he has or could have a conflict of interests or in which the fair exercise of his public or official duties might be compromised;
  - (b) demean his office or position;
  - (c) allow his integrity to be called into question; or
  - (d) endanger or diminish respect for and confidence in the integrity of the Government of the Republic of Vanuatu.
- 66(2) In particular, a leader shall not use his office for personal gain or enter into any transaction or engage in any enterprise or activity that might be expected to give rise to doubt in the public mind as to whether he is carrying out or has carried out the duty imposed by sub article (1).

#### **DEFINITION OF A LEADER**

67 For the purposes of this Chapter, a leader means the President of the Republic, the Prime Minister and other Ministers, members of Parliament, and such public servants, officers of Government agencies and other officers as may be prescribed by law.

#### **LEADERSHIP CODE ACT 1998**

#### **LEADERS**

- 5. In addition to the leaders referred to in Article 67 of the Constitution, the following are declared to be leaders:
- (a) members of the National Council of Chiefs;
- (b) elected and nominated members of local government councils;
- (c) elected and nominated members of municipal councils;
- (d) political advisors to a Minister;
- (e) directors-general of ministries and directors of departments;
- (f) members and the chief executive officers (however described) of the boards and statutory authorities:
- (g) chief executive officers or secretaries-general of local governments;
- (h) the town clerks (or their equivalent in name) of municipal councils;
- (i) persons who are:
- (i) directors of companies or other bodies corporate wholly owned by the Government; and
- (ii) appointed as directors by the Government;
- (j) the Attorney General;
- (k) the Commissioner and Deputy Commissioner of Police;
- (I) the Solicitor-General;
- (m) the Public Prosecutor;
- (n) the Public Solicitor;
- (o) the Ombudsman;
- (p) the Clerk of the Parliament;
- (q) the Principal Electoral Officer;

#### Appendix A

- (r) the Auditor-General;
- (s) the Chairperson of the Expenditure Review Committee;
- (t) the Chairperson when acting in that capacity of the Tenders Board;
- (u) members of the Public Service Commission;
- (v) members of the Teaching Service Commission;
- (w) members of the Police Service Commission;
- (x) members of the Electoral Commission;
- (y) the Commander of the Vanuatu Mobile Forces.

#### PART 2

#### **DUTIES OF LEADERS**

#### **DUTIES OF LEADERS**

- 13. (1) A leader must:
- (a) comply with and observe the law;
- (b) comply with and observe the fundamental principles of leadership contained in Article 66 of the Constitution;
- (c) comply with and observe the duties obligations and responsibilities established by this Code or any other enactment that affects the leader; and
- (d) not influence or attempt to influence or exert pressure on or threaten or abuse persons carrying out their lawful duty.

#### PART 3

#### BREACHES OF LEADERSHIP CODE

#### **BREACH OF LEADERSHIP CODE**

19. A person who does not comply with Part 2, 3 or 4 is guilty of a breach of this Code and is liable to punishment in accordance with Part 6.

#### PART 4

#### ANNUAL RETURNS

#### **ANNUAL RETURNS**

- 31. (1) Every leader must complete an annual return for the preceding year setting out details of the leader's assets and liabilities in accordance with the form in the Schedule.
- (2) The annual return must be given to the clerk of the Parliament:
- (a) within 2 months of becoming a leader; and
- (b) by 1 March in each year.
- (3) The annual return must set out details, listed in subsection (4), of the assets and liabilities of:
- (a) the leader; and
- (b) the leader's spouse and children where feasible;
- (c) any trust of which the leader or the leader's spouse or children are a beneficiary where feasible.

#### Appendix A

- (4) The details to be set out in the annual return are:
- (a) all land and other property (except one family home);
- (b) all vehicles (except one family vehicle);
- (c) all shares in public or private companies;
- (d) all income;
- (e) all liabilities;
- (f) directorships in corporations;
- (g) all directorships or other office held in unincorporated bodies;
- (h) any assets acquired or disposed of during the period covered by the return;
- (i) any liabilities acquired or discharged during the period covered by the return.
- (5) The details must include assets within and outside Vanuatu.
- (6) The leader is not required to include:
- (a) any liabilities in respect of the family home; or
- (b) the personal effects of the leader and his or her spouse and children.

### FAILURE TO FILE ANNUAL RETURN

- 33. A leader who:
- (a) does not file an annual return as required by section 31, and after having been warned by the Clerk in writing of his failure to do so, fails to file the return within a further 14 days; or
- (b) files a return knowing that it is false in a material particular; is guilty of a breach of this Code.

### **LEADERSHIP CODE (AMENDMENT) ACT 1999**

### REPEAL OF SECTION 32 AND SUBSTITUTION OF NEW SECTION

- 1. Section 32 of the Principal Act is repealed and the following section substituted:
- "ANNUAL RETURNS CONFIDENTIAL EXCEPT FOR INVESTIGATIONS AND PROSECUTIONS
- 32. (1) Subject to subsection (2), the Clerk must keep confidential all annual returns given to the Clerk by leaders.
- (2) The Clerk must not make a part of an annual return, or the whole of an annual return, available to another person unless the Clerk is satisfied that the part or annual return is necessary for:
- (a) an investigation under Part 5 of this Act, or an investigation authorised by or under any other Act or law; or
- (b) a prosecution under Part 5 of this Act, or a prosecution authorised by or under any other Act or law.
- (3) The Clerk must publish in the Gazette on or before 14 March in each year a list of the leaders who have given or failed to give the Clerk an annual return. The list must set out the leader's name and the position the leader holds.
- (4) This section applies to an annual return required to be given to the Clerk on or after the day on which this section commences.".

#### COMMENCEMENT

2. This Act commences on the day on which it is published in the Gazette.

Mortgage (except on family home)

Other money owing

#### **TRANSACTIONS**

Assets acquired or disposed of during the year

Liabilities acquired or discharged

#### DIRECTORSHIPS AND OTHER OFFICES HELD

Name of company or other body

Position held

I declare that the information in this return is true.

Date Signature of leader

### APPENDIX B

### $\underline{\textbf{SCHEDULE}}$

### Form of Annual Return

Leader's name:

Section 31

Address:
Office or Position held:
Names of leader's spouse and children
Address (if different from leader's address)
ASSETS
Real and personal property:
Land
Houses (except one family home)
Vehicles (except one family vehicle)
Boats and other vessels
Other assets
Shares held
Name of company
Number of shares
Money in bank, credit union etc.
(Total only)
Income during previous year
Gifts received during the previous year
LIABILITIES
Liabilities



# LIST OF ALL THE LEADERS WHO HAVE FAILED TO GIVE THE CLERK AN ANNUAL RETURN FOR 2005.

#### LISTE DES HAUTES AUTORITES QUI N'ONT PAS RENT AU SECRETAIRE GÉNÉRAL UNE DECLARATION ANNUELLE POUR 2005

	•	
1.	Hon. Sato KILMAN	Deputy Prime Minister Ministry of Foreign Affairs
	•	Vice Premier Ministre
		Ministere des Affaires Etrangéres
2.	Hon. Isabelle DONALD	Minister of Comprehensive Reform Programme
		Ministry of Comprehensive Reform Programme
		Ministre du Programme de Reforme Globale
		Ministère du Programme de Reforme Globale
3.	Hon. Willie JIMMY	Minister of Finance
	•	Ministry of Finance
		Ministre des Finances
		Ministère des Finances
4.	Hon. Arnold PRASSAD	Minister of Youth and Sport
		Ministry of Youth and Sport
		Ministre de la jeunesse et des Sports
		Ministère de la jeunesse et des Sports
5.	Hon. Malon HOSPMANDER	Member for Malekula
		Députe de Malekula
6.	Hon. Marcellino PEPITE	Member for Santo
		Députe de Santo
7.	Hon. Andikar PHILIP	Member for Santo
		Députe de Santo
8.	Hon. Moanna Carcasses KALOSIL	Member for Port-Vila
		Députe de Port-Vila
9.	Hon. Joshua KALSAKAU	Member for Efate
	•	Députe d'Efate
10.	Hon. lavcuth SANDIE	Member for Santo
		Députe de Santo
11.	Hon. Lum JOHN	Member for Santo
	-	Députe de Santo
12.	Hon. Vohor Serge RIALUTH	Member for Santo
	·	Dánuto de Canto

Députe de Santo

1	APPENDIX C	Premier Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Agriculture
28	. Jeffrey LAWA	Second Political Advisor Ministry of Agriculture Deuxième Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Agriculture
29	. Eddie KALPUKAI	Third Political Advisor Ministry of Agriculture Troisième Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Agriculture
30	). Pakoa KALTONGA	First Political Advisor Ministry of Infrastructure Premier Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Infrastructure
31	Jack SAPA	Second Political Advisor Ministry of Infrastructure Deuxième Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Infrastructure
32	2. Ruwea SERO	Third Political Advisor Ministry of Infrastructure Troisième Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Infrastructure
33	3. Alfred KALONTAS	First Political Advisor Ministry of Education Premier Conseiller Politique Ministère de l'Education
3,	4. Clarence MARAE	First Political Advisor Ministry of Youth and Sports Premier Conseiller Politique Ministère de la Jeunesse et des Sports
3	5. Maxwel MAJAMAJA	Second Political Advisor Ministry of Youth and Sport Deuxième Conseiller Politique Ministère de la Jeunesse et des Sports
3	6. Frisha SINE	Second Political Advisor Ministry of Foreign Affairs Deuxième Conseiller Politique Ministère des Affaires Etrangeres
3	7., Dick TETE	Third Political Advisor Ministry of Foreign Affairs Troisième Conseiller Politique Ministère des Affaires Etrangeres
	18. John TOMAKI	Third Private Secretary Speaker's Office Troisième Secrétaire du Président Parlement

**APPENDIX C** 

Nadia KANEGAI

39.

Member Public Service Commission

·	APPENDIX C	Directeur Adjoint Services des la Santé Communautaire du Sud
53.	Timothy VOCOR	Director Northern Community Health Service Directeur
		Service de la Santé Communautaire du Nord
54.	Eric SAMMY	Director Department of Geology, Mines and Water Resources Directeur
		Service de la Géologie, Mines et de l'Hydrologie
55.	Jean Marc PIERRE	Director Lands Record office
		Directeur
		Service des Cadastres
56.	Ture KAILO	Director  Department of Youth and Sport
		Directeur
		Service de la Jeunesse et des Sports
57.	Ronald SANDY	Director
		Cooperatives Department Directeur
		Services des Cooperatives
58.	Kaltag SAKARI	Chairman
,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		Teaching Service Commission
		Président Commission du Service de L'Enseignement
59.	Joseph CASTEN	Director
37.	)030ph	Civil Aviation Department
		Directeur Service de l'Aviation Civile
	- MARWAVENC	Principal Immigration Officer
60.	James NARWAYENG	Department of Immigration
	•	Officier Principal du Service de l'Immigration Bureau de l'Immigration
		Bûlean de i iminîstation
61.	Peter MORRIS	Director Statistics Office
		Statistics Office
		Bureau de la Statistique
62.	Morris KALORAN	Director
02.		Department of Woman's Affairs
		Directeur Services des Affaires Féminines
,-	Peter TAURAKOTO	Ombudsman
63.	Lefter I Walture 10	Office of the Ombudsman
		Mediateur par Intérim
		Bureau du Mediateur

**Public Solicitor** 

Office of the Public Solicitor

Hillary TOA

64.

	A DOCKIDIY C	
•	APPENDIX C	Directeur Général Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
76.	Leo TAMATA	Vice Chairman Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
		Vice Président Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
17.	Peter SALEMALO	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
* <b>*</b>		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
78.	Toni NARI	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
79.	Ps. Thomas NIDITAUAE	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors Membre
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
80.	John Morrison WILLIE	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors Membre
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
81.	Saby NATONGA	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors Membre
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
82.	Christian WUS	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors Membre
		Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
83.	Starky BONG	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors Membre
	•	Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
84.	Joe Still TARI	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
4		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
85	. Luke SAWIA	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
86	. Lency KAUN	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair
87	7. Charles BICE	Member Air Vanuatu and Vanair Board of Directors
		Membre Conseil d'Administration de Air Vanuatu et de Vanair

100	0. Michael KALORAI	APPENDIX C	
	TOTAL TOTAL ORAL		Member
			Education Selection Board Membre
			Conseil de l'Orientation de l'Education
101.	Leony MAKIKON		
			Member
			Teaching Service Commission Membre
			Commission du Service de l'Enseignement
102.	Serma RAUPEPE		de l'enseignement
102.	Serina RAUPEPE		Member
			Teaching Service Commission
			Membre
			Commission du Service de l'Enseignement
103.	Allan NAFUKI		Member
			Teaching Service Commission
			Membre
			Commission du Service de l'Enseignement
104.	Mark IMBERT		Member
			Teaching Service Commission
			Membre
	•		Commission du Service de l'Enseignement
105.	Christian LIU		
			Chairman
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Président
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
106.	Carl DAVID	•	
			Vice Chairman
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Vice-Président
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
107.	Mackenzie TARI		
			Member
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Membre
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
108.	John Harry LEO		
	year riarry ELO		Member
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Membre
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
109.	Maxwell THOMAS		Toolies de Daye
			Member
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Membre
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
110.	Peter LAMI		
10.	reter LAMI		Member
			Vanuatu Commoditties Marketing Board Membre
			Conseil d'Administration de l'Office de
			Commercialisation des Produits de Base
			··· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

Commercialisation des Produits de Base

### **APPENDIX C**

		·
.07	John Tavuiae TAMATA	Member
123.	JOHN TAVUIAE TAPIATA	Sanma Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de SANMA
124	Josen BOE	Member
124.	Josen DOL	Sanma Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de SANMA
125.	Paiialoloso VARAHU	Member
		Sanma Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de SANMA
126.	Timothy NOV	Member
120.	Innothly ROV	Sanma Provincial Council
		Membre
	•	Conseil Provincial de SANMA
		College Lionneign de Syldring
127.	Christian MALIU	Member
,		Sanma Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de SANMA
		Carrent Carrent
128.	Bebe TELKON	Secretary General
		Penama Provincial Council
		Secretaire General
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
129.	Morrie TABI	Assistant Secretary General
12.7.	Pionie IADI	Penama Provincial Council
		Secrétaire General
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
		_
130.	Tabimal MICHEL	Secretary
		Penama Provincial Council
		Secrétaire
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
474	Commercial CATA	Member
131.	Steven SAU	Penama Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
		Coffsell Lloadificial de 1 partir 19
132.	Thompson LIU	Member
1	- ···	Penama Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
		Member
133.	Tamtam PHILEMON	Penama Provincial Council
		Membre
		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
134.	Patrick TUGU	Member
137.	I dulcz i ucu	Penama Provincial Council
1		Membre
1		Conseil Provincial de PENAMA
135.	Silas ARU	Member
		Penama Provincial Council

(

#### APPENDIX C

148:	Morrison ROY	Member Shefa Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de SHEFA
149.	Thompson Witlie TAURA	Member Shefa Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de SHEFA
150.	Sokomanu MOTOUTORUA	Member Shefa Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de SHEFA
151.	Tom REUBEN	Member Shefa Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de SHEFA
152.	Lazar TAOUS	Vice President Tafea Provincial Council Vice President Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
153.	Andrew NALING	Member Tafea Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
154.	Willie JOEL	Member Tafea Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
155.	lata KAWIAMEGA	Member Tafea Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
156.	Tom KOUT	Member Tafea Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
157.	Kassu NAUNG	Member Tafea Provincial Council Membre Conseil Provincial de TAFEA
158.	Denis SAVOIE	Clerk Luganville Municipal Council Maire Conseil Municipal de Luganville
159.	Brownhill HARRY	Lord Mayor Luganville Municipal Council Maire Conseil Municipal de Luganville

République de Vanuaru



Republic of Vanua

Perliament House Port Vila, P.M.B. 052 Téléphone (678) 22229 Telécopie (678) 24520

The Clerk

APPENDIX D

Le Greffier - Secrétaire Général

Our Ref: SG/C/59/06/LBS-sg

Mr. Peter Taurakoto Ombudsman Office of the Ombudsman Port Vila REPUBLIC OF VANUATU

Dear Sir,

### FAILURE OF 162 LEADERS TO SUBMIT RETURN FORMS 2005.

We write regarding the above, and apologize in responding late to your letters of 16<sup>th</sup> November and 8<sup>th</sup> December 2006 on the same.

To your queries we respond as follows.

- 1. We did not give any warning to any of the 162 leaders who had failed to submit an annual return for 2005 prior to publication in the Gazette.
- 2. We cannot provide a list of those leaders since there had not been any warning given to any of them.
- 3. We did not have time to have the list of those leaders who have failed to submit annual return compiled and gazetted in due course as we had other duties to take care of.
- 4. Apart from the lists that were published in the Gazette, we do not have any document relevant to the above we could provide you with.

THE

Yours sincerely,

CLERK OF PARLIAMEN